

Suggestion system evaluation and development based on CIPP for improvement and productivity in organization

Ali Pakdel, Shah Rollah Abdul Wahab, Hojatallah Mousapour, Negar Mahmoodzadeh

Faculty of Management & Human Resources Development, Universiti Teknologi Malaysia, Johor, Malaysia

Email address

pakdelali52@yahoo.com (A. Pakdel)

To cite this article

Ali Pakdel, Shah Rollah Abdul Wahab, Hojatallah Mousapour, Negar Mahmoodzadeh. Suggestion System Evaluation and Development based on CIPP for Improvement and Productivity in Organization, *American Journal of Business, Economics and Management*. Vol. 2, No. 1, 2014, pp. 22-27

Abstract

Today one of the problems that organizations are faced with is manpower problem and organization disability for optimal using of the potential of employees, especially in professional and expertise level. Accomplishing that lead to decreasing organization productivity and disability for competing in national and international level. As many reports confirm that, most corporation success depends on employing of appropriate style that lead to developing individual capacity of staffs and creating commitment, responsibility and self-esteem in them. The best known tool to get involved is suggestion system that is an effective factor in changing working situation and creating a good basis for employee's participation. In this paper in addition to introducing suggestion system, it's provided a CIPP model for evaluating and improving this system to organizations increase their productivity and remove the manpower problem.

Keywords

Suggestion System, Process, Secretariat, Evaluation, Productivity

1. Introduction

Total quality management in brief definition is a customer focused management approach in which all people try to provide service and goods with superior quality for their customers based on improving own working processes. Various organizations in world to solve manpower problem that one of most common and is important issues use participative management style. Based on most of the reports and existing facts, success of most corporations depends on the appropriate use of this style that lead to developing individual capacity and creating esteem self, responsibility and involvement [11]. Suggestion system is an instrument for live, healthy and sustainable communication with employees and since this act is accomplished voluntary and optional between senior management, middle managers and employees, this tool creates more responsibility and involvement sense among

employees than improvement in the organization.

2. Introducing Suggestion System

Best known tools for getting involved is suggestion system or idea mobilization project that is one of the effective factors in changing working situation and creating an appropriate base to an employee's participation [10]. In fact this tool is to represent individual and group initiative and creativity among employees to create and develop a spirit of partnership in order to create dynamic and developing processes and products quality and service [8]. On the other hand, suggestions system is the subordination of knowledge and flowing thought and avoiding from promoting the spiritual despotism. Thereby, the organization achieves preparation to enter puberty and

promoting participatory spirit.

3. Imperative Reasons

3.1. Since managers with their all experience always don't have proficiency in all aspects of small thing, then employees who cooperate in the work operation surely can have a better suggestion than directly related to work.

3.2. Since collective wisdom and thinking excel in individual wisdom, hereupon collective wisdom and thinking by creating a suggestion system solve problems.

3.3. Employee participation in management, create a sense of ownership among employees. So they are forced to think and use their thinking toward growth themselves and the organization.

3.4. Suggestion system implementation leads to the development and promotion of human and organization in final.

3.5. This system should be implemented to big and small problems that can be perceived and all people in component parts of the organization can perceive problems and eliminate them by offering a solution.

3.6. People always looking for cooperation and collaboration of the team. Establishment of this system meets this request and cause to solve problems through collective thinking and team collaboration.

3.7. Various firms and organizations always follow economic benefit, growth and excellence. Establishment and offering plans with thoughts of organization employees create economic benefit and employee satisfaction.

3.8. By implementing a suggestion system as a process, either employees participate in their own and organization fate or make more efforts to achieve the goals defined by designing high and long term goals for the organization and will ensure organizational dynamics in the long term [2].

Table 1. Evaluating CIPP Model in the Suggestion System (Programs Level in Suggestion System)

Parts	Number of Programs
Context	15
Input	11
Process	11
Product	18

4. Evaluation CIPP Model

Evaluating model CIPP includes four parts that we are reviewing them in the suggestion system by expressing that as following;

4.1. Background

The system suitability level requirement for realizing the system is considered. Based on table 2 can be seen general outline in the suggestion system background.

Table 2. General Outline in the Suggestion System Background.

No	General Outline
4.1.1	Managers using a rate of employee's involvement in making decision before implementing suggestion system
4.1.2	Employees and managers belief in collaboration
4.1.3	Managers belief to resource allocation from a corporation with employees
4.1.4	Mental and operational preparation of management for supplying financial costs of new management system performance
4.1.5	Matching between rules and provisions; and employee collaboration with management
4.1.6	Existence of mutual trust between employees and managers
4.1.7	Existence of educational periods in firms
4.1.8	Existence of new management style in firms
4.1.9	Centralization of quality and customer oriented
4.1.10	Existence of relative stability in companies
4.1.11	Managers and employees belief in growth and development
4.1.12	Considering corporation in company's strategies and policies
4.1.13	Believing group and team work
4.1.14	Existence of suggestion boxes
4.1.15	Managers belief to benchmarking

4.2. Input

In this stage what is needed for implementing the system and is designed before implementation are considered. According to the table 3 can be seen the result of the general outline.

Table 3. General Outline in the Suggestion System Input

No	General Outline
4.2.1	Codification of appropriate regulations for system Implementation
4.2.2	Codification of implementation and operational program
4.2.3	Designing systems of receiving-evaluation-and suggestion option
4.2.4	Designing of reward assessment and premier plans
4.2.5	Supplying needful budget for performance
4.2.6	Codification of continuous system assessment program
4.2.7	Designing and codification of educational programs and visiting the conference holding
4.2.8	Employing consultants and specialists
4.2.9	Definition of partnership range and managers and employee's duties
4.2.10	Planning for the reorganization of the performing team
4.2.11	To be determined the limitation and management expectation

4.3. Process

At this stage, how performing system with regard to input is reviewed which its general outlines in the suggestion system area is table as follows;

Table 4. General Outline in the Suggestion System Process

No	General Outline
4.3.1	Using experienced consultant and specialists
4.3.2	Implementing of suggestion system based on respective regulation
4.3.3	Fast implementing of approved suggestions
4.3.4	Prompt payment of bonuses approved
4.3.5	Choosing the best annuity plans
4.3.6	Creating groups to assist and improve the quality
4.3.7	Continuous system improvement
4.3.8	Practical support of management from system performance
4.3.9	Establishing suggestion system secretariat
4.3.10	Choosing appropriate secretary
4.3.11	Holding of celebrations and conferences and accomplishing required propaganda

4.4. Performance Result

At this stage, reviewing of impacts and system conclusions is considered that its general outline is as follows;

Table 5. General Outline Performance Result in the Suggestion System

No	General Outline
4.4.1	Employee satisfaction
4.4.2	Flourish and creativity and innovation
4.4.3	Pleasantries reduction
4.4.4	Waste reduction
4.4.5	Economical saving
4.4.6	Intellectual growth of employees
4.4.7	Company performance improvement
4.4.8	Increasing employee's income
4.4.9	Product quality improvement
4.4.10	Increasing production
4.4.11	Creating a spirit of teamwork
4.4.12	Improving relations between managers and employees
4.4.13	Creating safe company communication space and waste reduction
4.4.14	Creating a spirit of investigation among employees
4.4.15	Promoting an organizational sense of loyalty and belonging
4.4.16	Human development
4.4.17	Realizing the organization's goal
4.4.18	Creating evaluation

5. Suggestion System Development Ways

Now with regard to affecting the level of model components CIPP on system performance, a final suggestion for development and promoting a suggestion system in the organization is as follows;

5.1. Background Part

In order for a company to have a good situation, it must move toward creating and promoting general corporation among its own employees and managers and try to consider a participatory discussion on organizational culture [9]. Also, among policies, commitment and strategy of the organization, try to motivate employee participations

creating the suggestion system basis in an efficient way. In addition, transform organization action for self, and one central toward participation can be efficient ways. It's clear that when one central background is eliminated in company collection then surely a suggestion system in such organization and company not only is active but also always appropriate growth [4]. Hereupon following suggestion is offered;

5.1.1. Promoting employee beliefs in participation and cooperation for accomplishing affairs and effecting of that on organizational performance is clear.

5.1.2. Institutionalization of participation and suggestion system discussion in organizational culture. In order to that suggestion system in organizational culture can be institutionalized by various mechanisms like supporting of senior management of teamwork and suggestion system, motivating group work and appreciating of top suggestions.

5.1.3. Placing participation discussion in policy, commission and strategy of the organization: Employees and manager's participation with modern management lead to organization excellence growth and various participation programs leads to new movements in company and in final at offering new suggestion.

5.1.4. More attention to quality and customer needs in organization strategy and policies: Since the philosophy of each organization is based on meeting customer need and satisfying customer can affect in organizational success, so meeting customers need discussion and production quality must be considered more.

5.2. Input Part

Since proper establishment depends on receiving proper input, then companies employing inside and outside of the company's experts and consultants provide regulation in own set and establish proper organizational rules to create a suggestion system. Providing rules and regulation and employing specialist consultants without creating change in management style and operational belief of management to comprehensive support from suggestion system don't lead to organization development and government. Secretary of system should offer a criterion for all movements and plan appropriate way for system governance and inform this issue to employees in appropriate and various ways [6].

All these movements without supplying budget and financial facilities cannot be offered. Hereupon management with employing experts should determine required budget for this purpose so that missionary movements, employing consultants, providing rules and regulation and systems operative flow of suggestion system. With readiness, management should change management style if it is not agreeable. Accomplishing foregoing arrangements has motivated all before beginning of suggestion system and then surely will welcome well in the beginning [15]. In regard to expressed extents, the following suggestion is offered;

5.2.1. Using more internal and external experts and advisors and using benchmarking in establishing suggestion

systems.

It's better to use internal and external employees' ideas and experience that has activated in participation system to success more in suggestion system performance.

5.2.2. Providing appropriate regulation and changing that based on time situation and on final updating regulation constantly. Any movement for proper bookkeeping is necessary and regulation and usually it identifies problems and obstacles and regulation faults and then its change based on requirement lead to dynamic of regulation. With regard that, establishing an active secretariat and appointment of a full time secretary and remove the basic growth problem and suggestion system development.

5.2.3. Creating change in management style and welcoming of management to employee participation in organization and management affair. Companionship senior management and middle managers and offering suggestion from their behalf cause this systematic promotion and more empathy of employees and managers.

5.2.4. To have a comprehensive plan for evaluating system in all parts and planning and providing a mechanism for continuous improvement in suggestion systems of organization. Comprehensive plan causes deliberated appropriate and organized actions and this issue because avoiding from being without a program in everyday movements related to suggestion systems.

5.2.5. Choosing appropriate criteria and standards for evaluating plans. In order to that, it's better to codify evaluation criteria and standards and suggestion option employing with expert ideas.

5.2.6. Installation of enough advertisements, notices and brochures related to the suggestion system in appropriate place.

5.2.7. Matching measure and reward payment way related to top offers .reward related to top suggestion should be proportionate to suggestion type and its payment must accomplish as soon as possible to employee motivation don't eliminate.

5.2.8. Supplying required budget for operation of suggestion system. Required budget should allocated using various experts and necessary proceedings accomplish toward its supplying.

5.3. Process Part

In addition to backgrounds and appropriate inputs, proper operation is an important issue that must be considered. Also, integrity speed, precision, variety, development and supervision action must be considered [12]. In enforcement discussion, speed in reviewing suggestions, organizations should be choosing good projects, and give proper rewards for selected suggestions to employees. In final, managers should finding various and proper solution for more tendency of employees to submission suggestions system. The important factor is faced with growth and development of a system that must create a situation in suggestion system performance using offering new ideas and plans and

scientific method in such a way which this system is a new, dynamic and flexible. On the other hand, employees should observe manager's honesty in reality and feel their commitment in what they promised [1].

Employees feel idleness and leave the system gradually if it be negligence and carelessness in reviewing plans. Company director's nit only should have speed and accuracy and honesty but also should avoid from the uniformity of the system to have dynamic and development at work. This diversification and creating new movements cause the group that usually are off and hardly are willing to contribute enter into the ground. With the passage of time, suggestions are personal in common and repetitive and personal plan also sophistication is required and cause a problem because just one person offering it [14].

In this regard, it should be leaded to the public plan and then creating community groups. Leaning to cooperation teams should motivate in various ways [5]. In next step cooperation groups which is found the required form should be organized as problem solution and refer the problem to them. In this regard, the productive resolving team is formed from within community groups [3]. This movement causes vitality and dynamism of the system and being welcomed by employees. In this regard following suggestions are offered;

5.3.1. Offering varied and convenient solution to movement rout regard to time and place based on each set situation on company for better performing on suggestion system and its proper growth. How various and appropriate solutions are offered, tending and attracting of employees to system is increased. For example, the variety of ways as the following can be suggested;

A. The secretariat of the system can establish their project review committee meetings within industries, areas, workshops, parts and reviewing plans within sets instead using the closed meeting room, it shows how to review plans to employees. Meanwhile, verbal protest and participating in reviewing plan meeting is possible for employees, in fact it's convinced everyone in regard to reasonable and appropriate plan reviewing.

B. Continuous and active presence of system secretaries within collections, personal negotiating with employees and making employees to think is one of the best solutions to system development.

C. Holding brainstorming meeting in regard to firm problems and issues and collecting suggestion, not only cause tendency of people, but also working group grow and problem solving group is formed.

D. With the diversification of management to work and work turning, new idea come to employee mind and system grows.

5.3.2 Proper payment and propagation and culture and motivating associates to participate in suggestion system. Funding and increase revenue of employee is one of the important issue effective motivation for participating in the system and cause a tendency to the system.

5.3.3. To accelerate procedure reviewing, evaluating suggestion, choosing suggestion, in this regard, factor and

steps that cause to process to be slow or long, reviewing and should be identified and then resolve. Also with the increasing master plan committee and subcommittees grant the right sufficiently, in addition to accelerating the reviewing process and evaluating plan toward development of the system.

5.3.4. Supervision, cooperation and solidarity of manager's suggestion system performance.

5.3.5. Choosing top suggestion based on predefined criteria. The suggestion should be reviewed based on predefined criteria and based on that are chosen, and it should not be accomplished based on prejudice and personal judgment and discrimination.

5.3.6. Organizations should be paid reward that related to selected suggestions for increase of employee motivation. In this regard, it is better that instead increasing reward in pay stubs, rewards is paid in cash as soon as possible, or reward is paid in public at meeting, celebrations and between prayers.

5.3.7. Establishing suggestion group or community group and giving priority to team recommendations, expert group, think as a team generally. In final establishing community groups to solve organizations' problem with problem solving groups. It makes the suggestion system more productive, active and efficient. Offering various plan and discussion related that in community group and solving problem lead to create dignity for employees and finally human development.

5.3.8. Expanding suggestion system to contractors, costumers and family of employees. It leads to system attending from outside of the company internally and then more development.

5.3.9. Providing office spaces, instruments, informations, documents and other facilities for Submitters.

5.3.10. Full communication and appropriate interaction of secretary and secretariat between suggestion system and who express problems and failures to suggest in order completing offers.

5.3.11. Holding suggestion review meetings within the units in the presence of Submitters and providing presence and ability to participate is discussions for Submitters.

5.4. Results Part

The result of the good performance lead to realizing the proper development of human and to create employee satisfaction and space between managers and employees is decreased. Development of human, self-esteem, job satisfaction, productivity and saving are the effects that systems create [7]. When employees suppose set as their own, then the distance between employees and managers are decreased. In this regard, following suggestion is offered;

5.4.1. Considering to human development mechanism: In this regard, employees must be motivated to submit their suggestion (how small is be), so that culture of offering suggestion is institutionalized and employees

within organization sense identity more.

5.4.2. Decreasing space of managers and employees: managers should try to aggress more their own to employees. Therefore, it causes to encourage the employees to give suggestions as well as increasing self-esteem.

5.4.3. Special attention of managers to creating an organizational sense of belonging to employees and their job satisfaction. If this sense that is created through different way exist, so employees suppose company as a set of their own, in result employees should have an active impact and responsibility, and offering suggestion leads to the development of organization and in final job satisfaction.

5.4.4. Special attention to empathy and solidarity among employees: It causes increased organizational affiliation of employees to a company and development of suggestion system.

5.4.5. Consideration of managers to production growth and waste decreasing: If managers represent their attention to growth and production development and waste decreasing in a company, employees offer ways to achieve this goal and through this, suggestions system will develop.

6. Conclusion

Findings of each research can be categorized in a suggestion system based on model components of CIPP in some chart and based on average from related to each component, and can find strengths and weakness, and improve the weakness and increase the productivity of the organization. In regard with accomplished review can be concluded that CIPP components are effective on improvement and productivity of the organization. And the effective conclusion is achieved in optimal performance of the suggestion system. It should be noted that employing CIPP model components of the organization are integrated and none of them not can be applied separately and segregated for employing in suggestion system.

Acknowledgement

I would like to state my appreciation to University Technology Malaysia (UTM), which afforded me the opportunity to do my PhD and expand my academic as well as dealing prospect.

References

- [1] Arnold, H. and Feldman, D. C. (1986). "Organizational Behaviour." MCGRW-HILL, COM.
- [2] Benito, J. G., Lorente, A. RM., and Dale, B. G. (1999). Business Process Reengineering to Total Quality Management. An Examination of the Issues Business Process Management Journal, Vol.5, No. 4, PP.24-32.

- [3] Dale, B. G. (1999). "TQM: What are the Research challenges?" Amsterdam, Elsevier science,publishers,BV.
- [4] Culler, J., and J. Holling Um. (1987). "Implementing Total Quality." SprinerVerla.
- [5] Harvey, D., Bowin, R. (1996). Human Resource Management. Prentice - HALL, INC; U.S.A.
- [6] Haji Sharif, M. (1998). Administrative structure and establishment of total quality management. Institute of NashreRamin.
- [7] Rahnavard, F. O. (1999). "Participatory management, theory and practice." State Management Training Center.
- [8] Rapp, C., and Eklund, J. (2002). Sustainable development of improvement activities the long- term operation of a suggestion scheme in a Swedish company. Total Quality Management. 13(7), 945–969.
- [9] Schuring, R., and Luijten, H. (2001). Reinventing suggestion systems for continuous improvement. International Journal of Technology Management. 22 (4), 359–372.
- [10] Snoeker, N. (2010). A survey on the influence of pay factors and character traits on perceived reward satisfaction and motivation. Ph.D. Thesis.
- [11] Stenmark, D. (2000). "Company-wide brainstorming: next generation suggestion systems?" In L. Svensson, U., Snis, C., Sorensen, H., Fagerlind, M., Magnusson, C., Ostlund (2000) (Eds). Proceedings of IRIS 23. Laboratorium for Interaction Technology, University of TrollhattanUddevalla. (pp. 1–13).
- [12] Verdinejad, F., Mughari, A. M., and Ghasemi, M. (2010). Organizational suggestion system in the era of holding by developing an innovative model: The Case of BonyadeTaavon Holding in Iran (an applied model). Iranian Journal of Management Studies (IJMS). 3 (3), 5–24.
- [13] Vlosky, R., and Aguilar, F. (2009). A Model of Employee Satisfaction Gender Differences in Cooperative Extension. Journal of Extension. 47 (2), 1–15.
- [14] Zaker, M. A. (1999). "Introduction to the participatory management system and suggestion systems." Institute of Development and Partnership Culture.
- [15] ZeraatPishe, A. M. (2007). Management based on the suggestion. Tadbir magazine, 114, 8 August.